

CONSERVATIVE EDUCATION IDEOLOGY OF ISLAMIC AND WESTERN PERSPECTIVES (STUDY OF THE THOUGHT OF MUHAMMAD JAWWAD RIDLA AND WILLIAM F. O'NEIL)

Nor Khidnaini¹, Ahmad Saefudin²

^{1,2} Universitas Islam Nahdlatul Ulama Jepara

Jalan Taman Siswa, Pekeng, Kauman, Tahunan, Jepara 59451

¹norkhidnaini8698@gmail.com, ²ahmadsaefudin@unisnu.ac.id

Abstract

This research aims to explore and compare conservative educational ideologies from Islamic and Western perspectives through a study of the thoughts of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil. The focus of this research is to understand the concepts, principles, and goals of conservative education promoted by both of them. Muhammad Jawwad Ridla, an Islamic education thinker, represents a conservative view of Islam, while William F. O'Neil, a Western education academic, brings a conservative perspective from the West. Both have similarities in emphasizing the importance of preserving traditional values and shaping students' character. This study uses a qualitative literature study approach by taking primary data from the main works of both, such as books and writings related to conservative educational ideology. Research findings are categorized into main themes: conservative concepts, educators' roles, educational goals, and students' views. This research provides a deeper understanding of the convergence and divergence between conservative educational ideologies in Islamic and Western contexts through comparative analysis. It is hoped that the research results can contribute to a more holistic understanding of the principles of conservative education and their implications in the global education context.

Keywords: Educational Ideology, Conservative, Islamic Education, Western Education.

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menggali dan membandingkan ideologi pendidikan konservatif dari perspektif Islam dan Barat melalui kajian pemikiran Muhammad Jawwad Ridla dan William F. O'Neil. Fokus penelitian ini adalah untuk memahami konsep, prinsip, dan tujuan pendidikan konservatif yang diusung oleh keduanya. Muhammad Jawwad Ridla, seorang pemikir pendidikan Islam, mewakili pandangan konservatif Islam, sementara William F. O'Neil, seorang akademisi pendidikan Barat, membawa perspektif konservatif dari Barat. Keduanya memiliki kesamaan dalam menekankan pentingnya melestarikan nilai-nilai tradisional dan membentuk karakter peserta didik. Studi ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif studi pustaka dengan mengambil data primer dari karya-karya utama keduanya, seperti buku-buku dan tulisan-tulisan terkait ideologi pendidikan konservatif. Temuan penelitian dikategorikan menjadi tema-tema utama yang mencakup konsep konservatif, peran pendidik, tujuan pendidikan, dan pandangan terhadap peserta didik. Melalui analisis perbandingan, penelitian ini memberikan pemahaman yang lebih dalam tentang konvergensi dan divergensi antara ideologi pendidikan konservatif dalam konteks Islam dan Barat. Hasil penelitian diharapkan dapat memberikan kontribusi pada pemahaman yang lebih holistik mengenai prinsip-prinsip pendidikan konservatif dan implikasinya dalam konteks pendidikan global.

Kata Kunci: Ideologi Pendidikan, Konservatif, Pendidikan Islam, Pendidikan Barat.

INTRODUCTION

When talking about education, one of the critical idioms that is considered is its ideological character. The thoughts of educational figures in the classical era influence today's educational ideology. They make valuable contributions to various educational ideological concepts (Kapoyos 2020:44–45). One of them is a conservative educational ideology. Some leading figures in this ideology include Emile Durkheim and Arthur Bestor, who were Western thinkers. Apart from that, in the context of Islamic thought, figures such as Al-Ghazali, Ibn Sahnun, and Al-Qabisi also played a role in developing this educational ideology (Laila Albaar, Ismail, and Machmud 2023:348).

William F. O'Neil, who is the main focus of this article, is a figure who played a vital role in reviewing educational ideology. He divided educational ideology into six characteristics. Three of them fall into the

conservative category: fundamentalism, intellectualism and conservatism. Meanwhile, the other three are classified as liberal, namely liberalism, liberationism and anarchism (O'neil 2008). In conservative education, according to William F. O'Neil, the focus is to maintain and direct patterns of social behaviour that have long existed and been accepted by society, such as community traditions, habits and norms. The main goal of conservative education is to convey social values that have become an established part of society.

Meanwhile, the Muslim thinker who succeeded in mapping the ideological pattern of education was Muhammad Jawwad Ridla (Muhammad Jawwal Ridla 2002). According to Ridla, Al-Ghazali's ideas influence the conservative educational ideology approach in Islamic education. Conservative can be defined as an attitude or behaviour that aims to maintain and maintain a particular situation, including existing habits and traditions (Al Muiz and Miftah 2020:54). In the context of Islamic education, the values maintained in a conservative approach indeed cannot be separated from the religious values and traditions of pious people.

The research aims to examine and compare conservative educational ideologies from Islamic and Western perspectives, focusing on the thoughts of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil. This research aims to understand how conservative educational ideology is defined and applied in these two contexts, as well as to understand the influence of the thoughts of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil on the development of conservative educational ideology in their respective religious and cultural contexts.

The urgency of this research lies in a deep understanding of conservative educational ideology from Islamic and Western perspectives. This study is critical because educational ideology shapes society's social, cultural and moral values. By better understanding the views of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil, this research can provide better insight into how conservative educational ideology is defined and applied in different religious and cultural contexts.

The study of conservative educational ideology has been a topic that has attracted the attention of many researchers over the years. This is due to this ideology's relevance and significant impact on the education system, including in Indonesia. As a primary reference, researchers moved from two main sources, namely the works of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil. For Ridla, Islamic education ideology is divided into three types, namely conservative (*al-muhafiz*), religious-rational (*al-diniy al-aqlaniy*), and pragmatic (*al-dzara'iy*). In short, these three ideologies have their distinctive dimensions. Conservative educational ideology (*al-muhafiz*) includes the maintenance and preservation of traditional values in Islamic education. The aim is to maintain and continue the religious and cultural heritage that exists in Islamic society. This is different from the ideology of religious-rational education (*al-Diniy al-Aqlaniy*), which tries to combine religious values with rational thinking. In this perspective, reason is necessary to produce individuals who strongly understand religion and can reason. Meanwhile, the pragmatic education ideology (*al-Dzara'iy*) focuses more on a practical and results-oriented approach. The goal is to educate individuals on skills and knowledge that can be applied in everyday life (Muhammad Jawwad Ridla 2002).

William F. O'Neil's view in providing the anatomy of educational ideology can be simplified into two types, namely conservative and liberal educational ideologies. Almost similar to Ridla's opinion, conservative educational ideology, according to O'Neil, as previously discussed, aims to maintain and preserve the values, traditions and patterns of behaviour that already exist in society. Conservative education often refers to maintaining established social and moral norms in social life. Liberal educational ideology, on the other hand, tends to be more open to change, experimentation, and new developments in education. This ideology emphasizes individual

freedom, critical thinking, and exploration in the educational process. This often includes values such as pluralism, equality, and innovation in education (O'neil 2008).

Relevant research results from other researchers support the two primary literatures above. For example, researchers link conservative educational ideology to Islamic Education (Al Muiz and Miftah 2020). Al-Ghazali's view, which can be considered representative of conservative educational figures in the Islamic context, emphasizes that the main knowledge is valuable in the current life and can bring spiritual benefits and a better life in the afterlife. In his perspective, knowledge should be worldly and have profound moral and spiritual dimensions. Thus, precious knowledge can help individuals achieve blessings and prepare them for life after death. This view is still very relevant to Indonesia's Islamic boarding school education system (Fahmi 2021). The conservative approach in Islamic educational institutions, also known as "Kiai or teacher conservatism," often emphasizes preserving traditional values (Pinrang 2020).

One of the novel elements in this research is comparing the thoughts of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla (Islam) and William F. O'Neil (Western) in the context of conservative educational ideology. This research can integrate social science, religion, and education perspectives to comprehensively describe conservative educational ideology in both Islam and the West. This research seeks to find the implications of conservative educational ideology on contemporary education from these two perspectives.

METHOD

The qualitative approach to literature study in this research provides the right way to explore the thoughts and views of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil regarding conservative educational ideology. With a qualitative approach, researchers reveal in-depth and complex findings that can provide valuable insight into conservative educational ideology from two perspectives (Adlini et al., 2022).

As a data collection strategy, researchers try to find primary sources related to the research topic. This search focuses on the principal works of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil and other primary sources relevant to conservative educational ideology. This step aims to obtain a solid and in-depth knowledge of these two thinkers' views and main concepts. The researcher explored vital themes, including identification and further understanding of the main concepts, central arguments, and values advocated by Ridla and O'Neil in the context of conservative educational ideology.

In the next step, researchers categorize essential findings, which are the main concepts of conservative educational ideology in their view. This process aims to develop a structured and comprehensive understanding of the related thoughts of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil. Researchers continuously reflect on and interpret the findings during the data collection stage. This reflection focuses on comparing the views of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil to identify similarities and differences between Islamic and Western perspectives regarding conservative educational ideology.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The conception of the Conservative Education Perspective of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'neil

William F. O'Neil, an educational academic, looks like a figure who had an essential impact on the world of education, even though information about his biography is limited. Known as an educational academic affiliated

with the University of Southern California, O'Neil created his presence by contributing to educational thought (O'Neill 2008).

One form of his contribution can be seen through his work entitled "*Educational Ideologies: Contemporary Expressions of Educational Philosophies*." This book, published by Goodyear Publishing Company, Inc. in Santa Monica, California, United States, shows its interest and emphasis on the philosophical understanding of education in a contemporary context. Although further information regarding his personal life and academic career may be limited, his work reflects his dedication to contributing to educational thought and theory.

In William F. O'Neil's conservative educational perspective, students are expected to receive clear guidance and solid learning before they become responsible statesmen. This understanding emphasizes the importance of a strong foundation in the educational process before students take on a significant role in society. O'Neil highlights individual similarities as a more crucial aspect than differences, which can be the basis for determining educational programs.

In practice, students are placed in classes differentiated based on age. Children enter school according to their age level at that time and move up a grade every new school year. This approach reflects the traditional structure of the education system, where students' progress and development are measured consistently based on their age level (Sanyata 2003:73). In addition, the focus on individual similarities suggests an emphasis on values that are considered universal and fundamental, thus forming the basis for the design of more uniform educational programs. This approach reflects a conservative orientation focusing on stability, tradition, and principles, considered the leading educational foundations.

In William F. O'Neil's view, educators have authority as mature and responsible educational personnel. They are considered professionals who respect established processes and are wise in responding to community demands. O'Neil emphasized the need for balance and wisdom in making changes so that excessive changes do not occur in the education system.

A teacher's authority should be based on his role and social status, considered a separate achievement or achievement for an educator (Saihan 2020). Society's dominant social norms and behaviour explain and determine teachers' rights. These rights are relative, depend on the social system that applies in society and are seen as an integral part of the role of educators in building and shaping the educational environment.

In the perspective of conservative educational ideology represented by Al-Ghazali and adhered to by Muhammad Jawwad Ridla, the position of students is prioritized to prioritise the purity of the soul free from evil morals. The concept of cleanliness in this context is not only limited to the physical aspect of clothing but is more profound, related to the cleanliness of the heart or mind (Al-Ghazali 2011:3).

This view emphasizes that mental cleanliness is the main focus of the educational process. More than just physical appearance, cleanliness of the heart is considered a critical aspect that influences the understanding, acceptance and application of knowledge. By maintaining the purity of the soul, students are expected to develop strong character, good ethics, and morality per the conservative values upheld.

Meanwhile, a teacher or cleric, according to Al-Ghazali, is seen as a figure who provides everything that has positive value, goodness, creativity or development to students without expecting any reward or reward (Subakri 2020). This view shows that the teacher's role is not only limited to transferring knowledge but also involves moral, spiritual and character-building aspects.

Educational Conservatism Perspective of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil: Analysis of Similarities and Differences

a. Educational Goals

In essence, the goal of conservative education, according to William F. O'Neil, is to support adherence to educational institutions and traditional or cultural processes that have been tested over time. Conservative education views the values, norms, and practices passed down from generation to generation as important continuity in shaping the character and identity of society.

In addition, this goal includes a deep respect for the law and social order in society. Conservative education sees law and social order as foundations that must be respected and upheld. By understanding and appreciating existing social structures, conservative education seeks to support constructive social change in line with the values that have become an integral part of culture and tradition (Sulasmi 2020).

Islamic education adopts Al-Ghazali's concept of two educational goals, consisting of long-term goals and short-term goals. The long-term goal in Islamic education is to get closer to Allah SWT. The educational process is directed so humans can understand and get closer to Allah, the God who created nature. This goal reflects the aspiration to achieve spiritual closeness and more profound knowledge of Islamic values. Meanwhile, the short-term goal in Islamic education is to achieve a profession that suits individual talents and abilities. Education is directed at helping humans recognize and develop their potential and talents. By pursuing a profession according to their talents, humans can contribute positively to society, create prosperity, and involve themselves in social development (Mucharomah 2017; Yustianty and Widia 2023).

The research found similarities between the concept of the goals of William F. O'Neil's conservative educational ideology and Al-Ghazali's perspective, which culminated in the established concept of God. O'Neil's concept of conservative educational ideology, both secular and religious, emphasizes the transmission of beliefs and practices that have been established or tested by time, especially those of Protestant churches or religious sects such as the Lutherans, Presbyterians, and Methodists.

According to O'Neil's perspective, this view highlights that the concept of God has a central role in life and education. This concept is the dominant foundation in shaping social views and behaviour. Both in religious teachings and in the context of secular life, O'Neil unites religious concepts into the category of preserving and continuing social behaviour. Al-Ghazali emphasized that education has a broader goal: to bring a person closer to Allah to achieve happiness in this world and the hereafter. For Al-Ghazali, education is about seeking knowledge and applying that knowledge in everyday life. According to Al-Ghazali, education is an intellectual effort to gain knowledge and a means of getting closer to Allah and achieving spiritual happiness.

b. Learning methods

The concept of conservative education introduced by William F. O'Neil aims to preserve and channel conventional social behaviour patterns. This conservative education focuses on preserving traditional values and maintaining a time-tested social order. In his religious-conservative views, Al-Ghazali emphasized the orientation of education to maintain religious purity, making him an adherent of conservative and religion-based education.

Conservatives, including Al-Ghazali, view that teaching methods should prioritize traditional approaches such as lectures, memorization, discussions and questions and answers. They see that this method is more suitable for maintaining the values and traditions they uphold. In this concept, teachers are considered

role models with a significant role in determining teaching methods. The view towards science is narrow, where science is defined as knowledge that is practical and useful for life in this world and the hereafter. They believe that precious knowledge can bring long-term benefits, especially in preparation for life after death. In the context of learning, this view demands that learning material must start from the Koran. The Koran is considered the primary source of knowledge that provides guidance and valuable knowledge in this world and the afterlife. This approach reflects the primacy of religious knowledge in guiding daily life and achieving higher life goals (Parid and Rosadi 2020:162).

When students face learning difficulties or face problems in life, teachers in conservative education have the responsibility to provide guidance, counselling and psychological therapy for students who need it. This approach reflects attention to students' moral and psychological aspects, as well as efforts to guide them in accordance with deeply held conservative values (Usman and Usman 2019).

c. Educators and Students

In the view of conservative educational ideology, students must be trained to become good individuals, which are measured based on traditional morals. This belief arises from the understanding that children tend to lead towards crime and mistakes if they do not receive strong direction and guidance from educators (Aini 2017:238).

Educators in this ideology aim to instil time-tested moral values in students. They believe that traditional morals form the basis of goodness and discipline necessary to maintain social order and ensure that individuals can contribute positively to society.

This approach reflects the belief that through character formation based on traditional values, students will become individuals who are responsible, obedient to social norms, and have moral integrity. Awareness of the dangers of potential crimes and mistakes is the basis for providing strong direction and forming a person who conforms to the moral standards upheld by conservative educational ideology.

This kind of opinion is relevant to the Islamic boarding school education system. In the educational tradition of Salaf Islamic boarding schools, the role of a Kiai (Islamic boarding school leader) is very central and robust. Kiai not only act as teachers of religious knowledge but also as authoritative figures responsible for many aspects of Islamic boarding school life (Hanafi 2018).

Kiai function as teachers of classical books, such as the Koran, hadith, fiqh, and other religious sciences. They transmit religious knowledge to the students directly, and often, learning is carried out using traditional methods such as recitation, discussion and memorization.

Apart from being a teacher, Kiai is an organizer and leader in Islamic boarding schools. They manage daily activities, arrange schedules, and provide instructions regarding order and discipline. Kiai are also often spiritual and moral figures whom the students respect.

As the owner of the Islamic boarding school, Kiai is also responsible for ensuring the continuity of the Islamic boarding school and the continuity of Islamic educational traditions. Education in Salaf Islamic boarding schools is often based on classical and traditional Islamic values, with the Kiai's role as the central pillar in maintaining and continuing the legacy of scholarship and spirituality.

This view reflects the belief in conservative educational ideology that similarities between individuals are more important than differences. Focusing on equality becomes a reference in determining appropriate and appropriate educational programs for students. This creates a level and equal basis for each individual to strive and be rewarded based on personal merit.

In this framework, students are considered to have equal opportunities to achieve success in education. They are free to determine their destiny but remain within traditional corridors that respect values and social norms that have been tested by time. This concept suggests that individual freedom must be within traditional limits, which are the foundation of goodness and social order (O'neil 2008).

Al-Ghazali emphasized that the relationship between educators and students must be filled with love, similar to the relationship between parents and children. Even though an educator may be an expert in a particular science, Al-Ghazali emphasizes the importance of not taking other scientific disciplines for granted. In dealing with students who have low abilities, educators must convey the material clearly and concretely (Muhammad Jawwal Ridla 2002).

CONCLUSION

In a study of conservative educational ideology from an Islamic and Western perspective that explores the thoughts of Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil, it can be concluded that these two thinkers have perspectives that are in line in several aspects. According to Muhammad Jawwad Ridla and William F. O'Neil, the conservative approach to education emphasizes the importance of preserving and continuing traditional values that have stood the test of time. This conservative concept includes the maintenance of customs and social values that are established in society.

Another similarity lies in the view that students have equal opportunities in education, focusing on individual equality and the formation of good character. Apart from that, both of them recognize the importance of educators as role models, providing advice and preventing students from despicable behaviour. Although there are similarities, there are differences in the roots of conservative thinking between the two. While William F. O'Neil places more emphasis on secular and political aspects in conservative educational ideology, Muhammad Jawwad Ridla places more emphasis on religious and spiritual aspects in the context of Islamic education.

Thus, this study provides a deeper understanding of the concept of conservative educational ideology from two different perspectives but has common ground in efforts to preserve values that are considered important in education.

DAFTAR PUSTAKA

- Adlini, Miza Nina, Anisya Hanifa Dinda, Sarah Yulinda, Octavia Chotimah, and Sauda Julia Merliyana. 2022. "Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Studi Pustaka." *Edumaspul: Jurnal Pendidikan* 6(1):974–80. doi: 10.33487/edumaspul.v6i1.3394.
- Aini, Rofiqotul. 2017. "Titik Temu Ideologi Pendidikan Islam Konservatif Dan Liberal." *EDUKASIA ISLAMIKA Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* II(2).
- Al-Ghazali, Imam Abu Hamid. 2011. *Ringkasan Ihya' 'Ulumuddin*. Bandung: Sinar Baru Algensindo.
- Fahmi, M. K. 2021. "Ideologi Pendidikan Pesantren Dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Perilaku Santri Di PPHMTA Kota Kediri." *Prosiding Nasional* 4(November):19–36.
- Hanafi, M. Syadeli. 2018. "Budaya Pesantren Salafi (Studi Ketahanan Pesantren Salafi Di Provinsi Banten)." *Al-Qalam* 35(1):103–26.
- Kapoyos, Richard Junior. 2020. "Paradigma Pendidikan Seni Melalui Ideologi Liberal Dan Ideologi Konservatif Dalam Menghadapi Era Revolusi Industri 4.0." *Musikolastika: Jurnal Pertunjukan Dan Pendidikan Musik* 2(1):39–50.

- Laila Albaar, Mizna, Radjiman Ismail, and Natsir Machmud. 2023. "Penerapan Nilai Pendidikan Konservatif Pada Anak Usia Dini." *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan* 9(5):347–53.
- Mucharomah, Miftah. 2017. "Titik Temu Ideologi Pendidikan Islam Konservatif Dan Liberal." *Edukasia Islamika* 2(2):172–90.
- Al Muiz, Mochamad Nasichin, and Muhammad Miftah. 2020. "Pendekatan Konservatif Dalam Pendidikan Islam (Kajian Teori Al Muhafidz Al-Ghazâli Dalam Pendidikan Islam)." *Jurnal Penelitian* 14(1):49–76. doi: 10.21043/jp.v14i1.6993.
- O'neil, William F. 2008. *Ideologi-Ideologi Pendidikan*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- O'Neill, William F. 2008. *Ideologi-Ideologi Pendidikan*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Parid, Miptah, and Rosadi. 2020. "Aliran Filsafat Dalam Pendidikan Islam Ditinjau Dari Perspektif Muhammad Jawwad Ridla." *Journal of Islamic Education Policy* 4(2):152–63. doi: 10.30984/jiep.v4i2.1285.
- Pinrang, Patampanua Kabupaten. 2020. "Potret Ideologi Pendidikan Dalam Penanaman Nilai Keislaman Di SDIT Imam Syafi'iy Kota Bima." *Jurnal Ilmiah "Kreatif"* 18(1):56–73.
- Ridla, Muhammad Jawwad. 2002. *Tiga Aliran Utama Teori Pendidikan Islam: Perspektif Sosiologis-Filosofis*. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana.
- Ridla, Muhammad Jawwal. 2002. *Tiga Aliran Utama Teori Pendidikan Islam (Perspektif Sosiologis-Filosofis)*. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana.
- Saihan. 2020. *Ideologi Pendidikan Pesantren*. Surabaya: Imtiyaz.
- Sanyata, Sigit. 2003. "Refleksi Paradigma Pendidikan Persekolahan." *Dinamika Pendidikan* 10(1).
- Subakri. 2020. "Peran Guru Dalam Pandangan Al-Ghazali." *Jurnal Pendidikan Guru* 1(2):63–75. doi: 10.47783/jurpendigu.v1i2.165.
- Sulasmi, Emilda. 2020. *Konsep Pendidikan Humanis Dalam Pengelolaan Pendidikan Di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Bildung.
- Usman, and Jamiludin Usman. 2019. "Ideologi Pendidikan Islam Pesantren Di Indonesia Perspektif Muhammad Jawwad Ridla Dan William O'neal." *TADRIS: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 14(1):115–31. doi: 10.19105/tjpi.v14i1.2398.
- Yustianty, Iin Khairunnisa Muhammad Thariq Aziz, and Winda Widia. 2023. "Intelektualisme Dalam Persepektif Pendidikan Dan Islam." Pp. 347–52 in *Prosiding Seminalu (Seminar Nasional LPPM UNIPAR Jember)*.